



# Heritage Alteration Permit 40 & 42 Askin Street, Wortley Village-Old South HCD HAP20-004-L

London Advisory Committee on Heritage  
Wednesday February 12, 2020

london.ca



## 40 & 42 Askin Street



- Built 1890-1891 for Edward J. Powell
- Unique semi-detached building
- Designated by By-law No. L.S.P.-2740-36 (1984) and Wortley Village-Old South HCD (2015)



## Heritage Alteration Permit Application

- Removal all original true divided light wood windows (27 windows in total)
- Replace with vinyl windows with faux grilles

Limited information about the existing conditions of the wood windows and the proposed replacement windows was submitted by the property owner as part of the Heritage Alteration Permit application.



## Wortley Village-Old South HCD Plan

### Section 8.2.7, Heritage Attributes – Windows, Doors and Accessories, of the Wortley Village-Old South Heritage Conservation District Plan:

*Doors and windows are necessary elements for any building, but their layout and decorative treatment provides a host of opportunities for the builder to flaunt their unique qualities and character of each building.*

### Section 8.3.1.1.e, Design Guidelines – Alterations, provides the direction to:

*Conserve; retain and restore heritage attributes wherever possible rather than replacing them, particularly for features such as windows, doors, porches and decorative trim.*

### Section 8.3.1.1.f, Design Guidelines – Alterations:

*Where replacement of features (e.g. doors, windows, trim) is unavoidable, the replacement components should be of the same style, size, proportions and material wherever possible.*



## Wortley Village-Old South HCD Plan

### Windows – Conservation and Maintenance Guidelines of Section 9.6 of the Wortley Village-Old South Heritage Conservation District Plan:

*The preservation of original doors and windows is strongly encouraged wherever possible as the frames, glass and decorative details have unique qualities and characteristics that are very difficult to replicate. Original wood framed doors and windows in most cases can be restored or replaced with new wooden products to match if the original cannot be salvaged, but may require a custom-made product. Take particular care that exact visible details are replicated in such elements as the panel mouldings and width and layout of the muntin bars between the panes of glass.*

*The replacement of original wood framed windows by vinyl or aluminum clad windows is discouraged. If this is the only reasonable option, the replacement windows should mimic the original windows with respect to style, size and proportion, with a frame that is similar in colour, or can be painted, to match other windows.*



## Analysis

- Do the existing wood windows need to be replaced?
- Why should wood windows be retained?
- Proposed replacement windows
- Alternate approaches



## Do the existing wood windows need to be replaced?

- In the Heritage Alteration Permit application, the property owners provided an opinion from the sales representative of the vinyl window company that they “do not believe your current windows are in any state to be repaired and are far past their life in terms of function and energy efficiency.”
- The Heritage Planner asked the expert window restorer to review the photographs submitted as part of the Heritage Alteration Permit in a blind test, without identifying the property. The restoration expert advised that, while the wood windows would benefit from repair, all of the wood windows were repairable.



## Do the existing wood windows need to be replaced?

- As it has not been demonstrated that the existing wood windows cannot be retained and restored (Policy 8.3.1.1.e, *Wortley Village-Old South Heritage Conservation District Plan*), the existing wood windows must be retained. The existing wood windows can be repaired and conserved.



## Why should wood windows be retained?

- Windows are the eyes of buildings – the illuminate interior spaces and give views out
- Preserving the original windows will preserve the architectural value of the property
- Wood windows are heritage attributes that contribute to a property’s cultural heritage value
- Windows reflect the architectural style and period of construction of the building
- Original wood windows are irreplaceable
- Wood windows can be repaired; vinyl replacement windows cannot be repaired
- Windows are generally considered to only account for 10-25% of heat loss from a building



## Why should wood windows be retained?

- Thermal performance of wood windows can be greatly improved by draught-proofing (e.g. weather stripping, storm windows, curtains) without their replacement
- Vinyl windows poorly attempt to replicate the details and profile of wood windows and true divided lights; vinyl windows are inauthentic
- Vinyl (poly-vinylchloride) is a non-renewal resource derived from petrochemicals
- Recycling does not exist for vinyl windows; they must be discarded in a landfill
- Vinyl windows have a very short lifespan; with maintenance, wood windows can last over 100+ years
- No material is “maintenance free”
- Wood window conservation is labour-intensive which supports skilled trades who use traditional methods



## Why should wood windows be retained?

- Historic wood windows (especially those built before WWII) are likely made of old-growth wood – denser, more durable, more rot resistant, and dimensionally stable
- Installing new windows is not going to “pay for itself” in energy savings; replacing windows is the most costly intervention with a lower rate of return when compared to less costly interventions. The savings in energy costs would experience an excessive payback period that would be longer than the lifespan of the replacement vinyl window. Some sources estimate the payback period as long as 100 years
- Other interventions, such as insulating an attic, can have a more substantial impact on thermal performance of a home
- Up to 85% of a window unit’s heat loss can be through a poorly weather-sealed sash; weather-stripping and other improvements can reduce this loss by 95%



## Proposed replacement windows

The proposed replacement are incompatible for the following reasons:

- A faux grille pattern (a plastic muntin between the panes of glass) poorly replicates the true divided light style of the existing windows
- Vinyl windows are bulkier and distort the proportions of wood windows
- Insufficient details on windows



## Alternate Approaches

- Repair existing wood windows
- Remove aluminum storm windows
- Install new storm windows
- Access grants (London Endowment for Heritage)
- Phase work over several years



## Ontario Heritage Act

Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* requires that a property owner not alter, or permit the alteration of, the property without obtaining Heritage Alteration Permit approval. The *Ontario Heritage Act* enables Municipal Council to give the applicant of a Heritage Alteration Permit:

- a) The permit applied for
- b) Notice that the council is refusing the application for the permit, or
- c) The permit applied for, with terms and conditions attached (Section 42(4), Ontario Heritage Act)



## Recommendation

That, on the recommendation of the Director, City Planning & City Planner, with the advice of the Heritage Planner, the application under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* seeking approval to remove the existing wooden windows and replace with vinyl windows on the property at 40 & 42 Askin Street, By-law No. L.S.P.-2740-36 and Wortley Village-Old South Heritage Conservation District, **BE REFUSED.**

