

Report to London Advisory Committee on Heritage

To: Chair and Members
London Advisory Committee on Heritage

From: John M. Fleming
Managing Director, Planning and City Planner

Subject: Heritage Alteration Permit Application by Josef Dolezel
508 Waterloo Street
West Woodfield Heritage Conservation District

Meeting on: Wednesday November 14, 2018

Recommendation

That, on the recommendation of the Managing Director, Planning and City Planner, with the advice of the Heritage Planner, the application under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* to replace windows at 508 Waterloo Street, within the West Woodfield Heritage Conservation District, **BE PERMITTED** with the following terms and conditions:

- a) The second floor main window replacement should mimic the same style, size and proportions as the original window
- b) The first floor main window should be preserved
- c) The Heritage Alteration Permit be displayed in a location visible from the street until the work is completed.

Executive Summary

The property at 508 Waterloo Street is located within the West Woodfield Heritage Conservation District, which is designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The property was altered without obtaining Heritage Alteration Permit approval. A Heritage Alteration Permit application was submitted on October 12, 2018 after 11 of the windows on the front façade had been replaced, including the attic windows (2), the solarium windows (8), and the second floor main window (1). The Heritage Alteration Permit application proposes replacing 12 wood windows with aluminum windows that have faux muntins and in two of the proposed alterations, awning windows.

The proposed replacement windows were analyzed using the conservation guidelines within the West Woodfield Heritage Conservation District Plan. The alterations for the attic and solarium windows are in accordance with the guidelines, but the alteration to the second floor main window and proposed alteration for the first floor main window do not comply with the guidelines.

The second floor main window was not preserved and the replacement does not mimic the style and proportions of the original window. The proposed replacement of the first floor main wood window also does not comply with the guidelines as the window can be restored, making the proposed replacement unnecessary. To ensure there are no adverse impacts to the heritage character of the West Woodfield Heritage Conservation District, the second floor main window should mimic the original window's style, size and proportions and the first floor main windows should be preserved.

Analysis

1.0 Background

1.1 Property Description

The property at 508 Waterloo Street is located on the east side of Waterloo Street between Princess Avenue and Dufferin Avenue (Appendix A).

1.2 Cultural Heritage Status

The property at 508 Waterloo Street is located within the West Woodfield Heritage Conservation District, which is designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

1.3 Description

The existing cultural heritage resource located at 508 Waterloo Street was constructed c.1893 in Queen Anne styling. 508 Waterloo Street is set back from Waterloo Street, has detailed gables, unique second floor window, spacious porch, double leaf doors and pairs with the 504 Waterloo Street (Appendix B).

2.0 Legislative/Policy Framework

2.1 Provincial Policy Statement

Heritage conservation is a matter of provincial interest (Section 2.d, *Planning Act*). The *Provincial Policy Statement (2014)* promotes the wise use and management of cultural heritage resources and directs that “significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved.”

2.2 Ontario Heritage Act

Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* requires that a property owner not alter, or permit the alteration of, the property without obtaining Heritage Alteration Permit approval. The *Ontario Heritage Act* enables Municipal Council to give the applicant of a Heritage Alteration Permit:

- a) The permit applied for;
- b) Notice that the council is refusing the application for the permit; or,
- c) The permit applied for, with terms and conditions attached (Section 42(4), *Ontario Heritage Act*).

Municipal Council must respond within 90 days after a request for a Heritage Alteration Permit application (Section 42(4), *Ontario Heritage Act*).

2.3 The London Plan

The policies of *The London Plan* found in the Cultural Heritage chapter support the conservation of London’s cultural heritage resources. Policy 554_ of *The London Plan* articulates one of the primary initiatives as a municipality to “conserve London’s cultural heritage resources so they can be passed on to our future generations.” To help ensure cultural heritage is conserved Policy 594_ (under appeal) of *The London Plan* provides the following direction:

1. *The character of the district shall be maintained by encouraging the retention of existing structures and landscapes that contribute to the character of the district;*
2. *The design of new development, either as infilling, redevelopment, or as additions to existing buildings, should complement the prevailing character of the area;*
3. *Regard shall be had at all times to the guidelines and intent of the heritage conservation district plan.*

2.4 West Woodfield Heritage Conservation District

The West Woodfield neighbourhood is one of London's older neighbourhoods and retains a large number of original buildings. Part of the overall goal of *West Woodfield Heritage Conservation District Plan* is to:

Recognize, protect, enhance and appreciate West Woodfield’s cultural heritage resources including buildings, landscapes and historical connections, and value their contribution to the community by:

- *Encouraging the retention, conservation and adaptation of the District’s heritage buildings and attributes, as described in the Study and Plan, rather than their demolition and replacement;*

West Woodfield Heritage Conservation District Plan provides direction on alterations that are on the street-facing façade of a building, as alterations can potentially have an

adverse impact on not only the building itself, but the entire streetscape. Guideline 8.2.1 directs:

- *Avoid “new” materials and methods of construction if the original is still available.*
- *“Restore” wherever possible rather than “replace”, particularly for features such as windows, doors, porches and decorative trim.*
- *Where replacement of features (e.g. – doors, windows, trim) is unavoidable, the replacement components should be of the same general style, size and proportions.*

Windows are specifically addressed in Guideline 10.6, *West Woodfield Heritage Conservation Plan*, stating:

- *The preservation of original doors and windows is strongly encouraged wherever possible as the frames, glass and decorative details have unique qualities and characteristics that are very difficult to replicate.*
- *The replacement of original wood framed windows by vinyl or aluminum clad windows is discouraged. If this is the only reasonable option, the replacement windows should mimic the original windows with respect to style, size and proportion, with a frame that is similar in colour, or can be painted, to match other windows.*

3.0 Heritage Alteration Permit Application

The West Woodfield Heritage Conservation District Plan identifies alterations where Heritage Alteration Permit (referred to as “Section 4.2.1 Alterations & Additions”) is required.

A Heritage Alteration Permit application was submitted by the property owner and received October 12, 2018. The property owner has applied for a Heritage Alteration Permit to:

- Remove original wood windows from the front façade; and
- Replace windows with “Gentek” aluminum windows with awning windows and faux muntins (Appendix C).

4.0 Analysis

There are clear guidelines within the West Woodfield Heritage Conservation District Plan pertaining to the preservation and replacement of windows. The guidelines direct that original wood framed windows should be preserved wherever possible and, if unavoidable, replacement windows should mimic the original windows with respect to style, size and proportion.

Based on the review of guidelines pertinent to this heritage alteration permit application, the attic and solarium replacement windows are in accordance with the guidelines as the windows are similar in style, size and proportions. However, the alterations to the second floor main windows and proposed alterations for the first floor main window do not comply to the guidelines.

The second floor main window was an original single hung sash wood window with unique decorative detail. While the original wood framing was retained, the replacement aluminum window has two awning windows with faux muntins. It is clear that the property owner has attempted to replicate the styling of the solarium windows throughout the other replacement windows, but this styling is not similar to the original window. Also, the two new awning windows change the proportions and how the window operates, which does not comply with the conservation guidelines.

The first floor main window, which has not yet been replaced, is a single hung sash wood window. The proposed replacement for the first floor wood window is similar to the

window currently on the second floor (an aluminum window that has two awing windows with faux muntins). Documentation supporting the removal of the window was not provided, therefore the current wood window can be restored and should be preserved. The West Woodfield Heritage Conservation District Plan provides the direction to “restore wherever possible rather than replace” and strongly encourages the preservation of wood windows.

5.0 Conclusion

In the West Woodfield Heritage Conservation District, it is important to ensure that alterations preserve the character of the house, and are complementary to adjacent dwellings. The attic and solarium windows were found to be in accordance with the guidelines, but the alterations to the second floor main window and proposed alteration for the first floor main window do not comply.

The alteration to the second floor main window does not comply with the guidelines as the original window was not preserved and the replacement does not mimic the style and proportions of the original window as directed by the guidelines. The proposed replacement of the first floor main wood window also does not comply with the guidelines as documentation supporting the removal of the window was not provided, therefore the current window can be restored and should be preserved.

To ensure there are no adverse impacts to the heritage character of the West Woodfield Heritage Conservation District, the second floor main window replacement should mimic the same style, size and proportions as the original window and the first floor main window should be preserved.

| | |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Prepared by: | Krista Gowan Heritage Planner |
| Submitted by: | Gregg Barrett, AICP Manager, Long Range Planning and Research |
| Recommended by: | John M. Fleming, MCIP, RPP Managing Director, Planning and City Planner |
| Note: The opinions contained herein are offered by a person or persons qualified to provide expert opinion. Further detail with respect to qualifications can be obtained from Planning Services | |

November 8, 2018
Kag/

Appendix A - Location



Appendix B –Images



Image 1: 508 Waterloo Street (c.1990)

Appendix C - Alterations

Table 1: Images of 508 Waterloo Street before alterations and proposed alterations

| 508 Waterloo Street Before Alterations | 508 Waterloo Street Alterations |
|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  <p><i>Image 2: 508 Waterloo Street - c.2016</i></p> |  <p><i>Image 3: 508 Waterloo Street – after alterations</i></p> |
|  <p><i>Image 4: Attic Windows - c.2016</i></p> |  <p><i>Image 5: Attic Windows - after alteration</i></p> |

508 Waterloo Street Before Alterations



Image 6: 2nd floor, main window c.2016

508 Waterloo Street Alterations



Image 7: 2nd floor, main window – after alteration



Image 8: Solarium Windows c.2016



Image 9: Solarium windows – after alterations



Image 10: 1st floor, main window- present



Image 11: Proposed replacement for 1st floor main window (photo courtesy of the property owner)