

Report to Planning and Environment Committee

To: Chair and Members
Planning & Environment Committee

From: John M. Fleming
Managing Director, Planning and City Planner

Subject: Heritage Places 2.0 – A Description of Potential Heritage Conservation Districts in the City of London

Public Participation Meeting on November 12, 2018

Recommendation

That, on the recommendation of the Managing Director, Planning and City Planner, with advice of the Heritage Planner, the following actions be taken with respect to the application of the Corporation of the City of London to update and replace the *Heritage Places* guideline document which applies citywide:

- (a) The proposed by-law attached hereto as Appendix “A” and the draft guideline document – *Heritage Places 2.0: A Description of Potential Heritage Conservation Districts in the City of London (Heritage Places 2.0)* – attached hereto as Appendix “C” **BE RECEIVED**;
- (b) The comments received from the Public Participation Meeting (PPM) of November 12, 2018 **BE CONSIDERED** in the preparation of the final *Heritage Places 2.0* guideline document and associated proposed amendment to *The London Plan*; and,
- (c) The attached draft of *Heritage Places 2.0* **BE CIRCULATED** to the London Advisory Committee on Heritage (LACH), the Urban League and relevant neighbourhood associations for feedback on this draft guideline document.

It **BEING NOTED** that the final guideline document *Heritage Places 2.0* will be brought before a future meeting of the Planning and Environment Committee for adoption as a Guideline Document to The London Plan following consultation with the LACH, Urban League and relevant neighbourhood associations.

Executive Summary

Purpose and the Effect of Recommended Action

The purpose and effect of the recommended action is to delete the reference to the guideline document entitled “Heritage Places: A Description of Potential Heritage Conservation Areas in the City of London”, and replace it with a new guideline document entitled, “Heritage Places 2.0: A Description of Potential Heritage Conservation Districts in the City of London” in Policy 1721 of the Cultural Heritage Guidelines of *The London Plan*.

Rationale of Recommended Action

Adoption of an updated *Heritage Places* guideline document – *Heritage Places 2.0* – requires an amendment to the City’s Official Plan, *The London Plan*.

The recommended amendment is consistent with Section 2.6.1 of the *Provincial Policy Statement (PPS)*, 2014 directing that “significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved.”

The recommended amendment conforms to Policy 570_ of *The London Plan* which asserts that City Council may adopt specific strategies for the purposes of cultural heritage protection and conservation, including: identification and designation of specific cultural heritage resources including properties and districts.

The recommended amendment conforms to Policy 1712_ of *The London Plan* which states that City Council may adopt guideline documents to provide direction for the implementation of the policies of the *Plan* or to guide development of a specific area.

Official Plan Amendment Analysis

1.0 Subject Lands

The lands affected by the Official Plan Amendment are City-wide.

2.0 Nature of Application

This report recommends approval of an amendment to *The London Plan* (Policy 1721) to adopt the attached update to *Heritage Places* entitled, *Heritage Places 2.0: A Description of Potential Heritage Conservation Districts in the City of London* as a Cultural Heritage Guideline under Guideline Documents of the Our Tools Section.

3.0 Relevant Background

3.1 Planning History

In 1993, *Heritage Places: A Description of Potential Heritage Conservation Areas in the City of London*, was approved as a guideline document to the *Official Plan* of the City of London. This document has been the primary reference used to identify candidate areas for the potential development of heritage conservation district areas within the City. Fourteen areas were originally identified within *Heritage Places* based on 'characterization studies'. These studies were intended to act as an indicator of heritage significance, but were never meant to be an exhaustive list of all areas within the City. Originally, the list of fourteen study areas was un-prioritized. A report to the London Advisory Committee on Heritage (March 1999) was the first to prioritize potential Heritage Conservation Districts (HCD), and this list has been amended, expanded, consolidated and re-prioritized over time. The City has since dealt with requests for HCD designation from the community in a sequential process based on these episodic re-prioritizations of areas identified in *Heritage Places*.

On January 16, 2017, Municipal Council directed Civic Administration "to review [the] prioritized list of potential Heritage Conservation Districts and to recommend an update to *Heritage Places*..." Since the adoption of *Heritage Places*, the planning and policy framework for heritage conservation in Ontario has undergone substantial changes, including most notably revisions to the *Ontario Heritage Act* in 2005 and the *Provincial Policy Statement* in 2014, and at the municipal level, adoption of *The London Plan* in 2016. Given these changes to heritage conservation planning and policy framework, and the accomplishments of the original *Heritage Places* (ten of the original fourteen candidate areas have been designated as HCDs), it is an opportune time to review and revise this guideline document.

Letourneau Heritage Consulting (LHC) was retained in March 2018 to prepare an updated document entitled, *Heritage Places 2.0: A Description of Potential Heritage Conservation Districts in the City of London*. The objectives of the update have been to conduct a comprehensive, city-wide review of areas, and prepare a prioritized list for further study of these areas as potential Heritage Conservation Districts (HCD) – pursuant to Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. The intention has been to essentially 'reset' *Heritage Places* to reflect current Provincial legislation, City policies, Council direction and community interest. LHC was tasked with the following:

1. **Review Policy Context** – Update background component of *Heritage Places* to reflect the *Provincial Policy Statement – 2014 (PPS)*, *Ontario Heritage Act* and *The London Plan* (London's *Official Plan*).

2. **Consult with Heritage Community** – With input from members of the London Advisory Committee on Heritage (LACH) and representatives from London's heritage community, undertake a city-wide comprehensive review of areas identified as having heritage significance, using a pre-established methodology, and prepare characterization studies of each area.
 - Re-evaluate (and update as needed) information on candidate areas already documented in the current *Heritage Places*.
3. **Develop Methodology** – Develop a method for identifying and prioritizing areas in the City—with possible cultural heritage value – for potential HCD designation.
 - Prepare a prioritized list for further study and consideration as potential HCDs.

Consultation with community stakeholders was integral to the preparation of *Heritage Places 2.0*. The consultation process was initiated in April 2018 starting with an introductory email-out to nearly 50 active members of London's heritage community including members of the: Architectural Conservancy of Ontario – London; Downtown London; Heritage London Foundation; London Advisory Committee on Heritage; London Heritage Council; London Planners Council, Middlesex Historical Society; and, the Urban League. A total of three roundtable discussions were conducted in May and June, with a series of informal interviews carried out both before and following the first roundtable. The second roundtable took place during the June meeting of the London Advisory Committee on Heritage (LACH) with participation of nearly the full committee. Throughout the consultation process, participants had the opportunity to provide feedback via email or phone. Over thirty people participated in the consultation process providing input on the identification of candidate areas for consideration as potential HCDs in London, along with what factors should be considered in the prioritization process.

In April 2018, a city-wide review of candidate areas for *Heritage Places 2.0* was initiated by the consultant. General areas having potential cultural heritage value or interest were identified based on heritage staff reports and existing heritage inventories, and areas previously identified in *Heritage Places* that had yet to be designated as HCDs. As well, members of London's heritage community provided input into potential areas for consideration during roundtable discussions. The goal was to develop an initial (working) list of candidate areas that merit further consideration as part of the *Heritage Places 2.0* project; over fifty areas were initially identified. A values-based assessment was applied to further cull the list of candidate areas. Values were derived from: 1) those outlined in O.Reg. 9/06 – to capture associative, physical and contextual aspects of candidate areas; 2) those outlined in *The London Plan (Policy_576)* – to ensure that criteria captured overlapped with those that would be used for potential designation of candidate areas as HCDs; and, 3) those identified in the *Ontario Heritage Tool Kit* and the *Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada* – to capture additional values not necessarily related to the built/physical environment. The following values were used to identify candidate areas for *Heritage Places 2.0*:

- Historical/Associative Values
- Physical/Design Values
- Contextual Values
- Other values include:
 - Spiritual Values
 - Educational and Scientific Values
 - Natural Values
 - Archaeological Values
 - Social Values

These values provided a framework for the consideration of a range of factors reflected in cultural heritage resources. The over fifty candidate areas initially identified citywide, were then short-listed to fourteen and further prioritized.

The prioritization of candidate areas for consideration as potential HCDs was derived from a systematic review of other municipalities' practices, previous staff reports and

consultation with the members of the heritage community. The following factors were considered during prioritization of candidate areas:

- Results of the **values-based assessment** of candidate areas relates to how strongly each area met the characteristics associated with these values;
- **Potential for change** within an area can include development pressure, existing levels of protection, as well as a variety of external pressures, such as projected growth, threats to cultural heritage integrity, or the addition or loss of a significant economic driver;
- **Community preparedness** or readiness and willingness to initiate and engage in an HCD Study process;
- **Appropriateness of planning tool** (Part V – *Ontario Heritage Act*, HCD designation) for conservation of significant cultural heritage resources in the area versus other planning tools; and,
- **Other factors** such as previous Municipal Council direction, recognition of City planning priorities and implications of planned future initiatives.

The fourteen candidate areas that were identified were prioritized based on a qualitative assessment assigned to each of the above factors based on how strongly the area associated with that factor. It is recommended that the areas listed below be studied further, prioritized as follows:

1. Talbot North
2. SoHo (South of Horton)
3. The Smokestack District
4. Stanley-Becher-Riverforks
5. Dundas Street – Old East
6. Piccadilly
7. Old South II
8. Old North
9. Orchard Park Sherwood Forest
10. Lambeth
11. Hamilton Road
12. Braemar Crescent
13. Hall's Mills
14. Pond Mills

It is important to stress that the outcome of *Heritage Places 2.0* is not an evaluation or recommendation of these candidate areas for designation, but simply the identification and recognition that these areas have potential heritage significance. The prioritization of potential HCDs is also by no means a measure or reflection of the perceived cultural heritage value or interest or significance. These areas are not being recommended for designation, but may be recommended for further evaluation as part of Municipal Council decision to move forward with HCD Studies under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

It has been standard procedure for the City to move forward with an HCD study for potential district designation upon Council approval following a community request for such a study. The identification and further prioritization of these candidate areas in *Heritage Places 2.0* helps to manage community expectations and staff resources by providing clarity in scheduling of future work and transparency and fairness to the nomination process.

4.0 Rationale for Amendment

4.1 Requested Amendment

At its meeting on January 18, 2017, Municipal Council resolved that Civic Administration review the prioritized list of potential heritage conservation districts in the City, as well as update the current Heritage Places guideline document.

“...the Civic Administration BE DIRECTED to review the prioritized list of potential Heritage Conservation Districts and to recommend an update to Heritage Places, it being noted such a review may impact Heritage

Conservation District deadlines established in Municipal Council's Strategic Plan."

Adoption of an updated Heritage Places guideline document requires an amendment to the City's Official Plan, *The London Plan*.

The proposed Official Plan Amendment is to amend Policy 1721_4 of the Cultural Heritage Guidelines under Guideline Documents of the Our Tools Section of *The London Plan*, to remove reference to "Heritage Places: A Description of Potential Heritage Conservation Areas in the City of London", and to replace it with reference to "Heritage Places 2.0: A Description of Potential Heritage Conservation Districts in the City of London."

4.2 Community Engagement

Notice of Application was published in the Public Notices and Bidding Opportunities section of *The Londoner* on October 11, 2018. The notice advised of the possible amendment to *The London Plan* to remove reference to "Heritage Places: A Description of Potential Heritage Conservation Areas in the City of London" and replace it with reference to "Heritage Places 2.0: A Description of Potential Heritage Conservation Districts in the City of London".

Notice of Public Meeting was published in the Public Notices and Bidding Opportunities section of *The Londoner* on October 25, 2018.

No responses were received to either notice.

4.2.1 London Advisory Committee on Heritage

The LACH was consulted during the preparation of Heritage Places 2.0 as part of a Roundtable Discussion conducted on June 13, 2018. The intent of the discussion was to gain input from committee members regarding areas of the City that may have potential for further study as potential heritage conservation districts. The Stewardship Sub-Committee of the LACH was consulted on October 24, 2018 and the full committee of the LACH will be consulted at its meeting on November 14, 2018.

4.3 Policy Context

Planning Act

As identified under Section 2 of the *Planning Act*, "the conservation of features of significant architectural, cultural, historical, archaeological or scientific interest" is matter of Provincial Interest (2_d). This is reinforced through the *Provincial Policy Statement* (2014), which is issued under Section 3 of the *Planning Act*. Section 3(1) of the *Planning Act* requires that municipal decisions affecting a planning matter "shall be consistent" with the *Provincial Policy Statement*.

Provincial Policy Statement (2014)

Section 2.6.1 of the *Provincial Policy Statement* (2014) directs that "significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved." "Significant" is defined in the *Provincial Policy Statement* (2014) as, in regards to cultural heritage and archaeology, "resources that have been determined to have cultural heritage value or interest for the important contribution they make to our understanding of the history of a place, and event, or a people."

Ontario Heritage Tool Kit

The standard baseline for identifying potential Heritage Conservation Districts (HCD) under the *Ontario Heritage Act* (OHA) is outlined by the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport in the *Ontario Heritage Tool Kit document Heritage Conservation Districts* (2006). The *Tool Kit* does not provide specific criteria for the identification of candidate areas, however it does provide broad descriptions of characteristics that might constitute a Heritage Conservation District (HCD). The *Tool Kit* identifies that the "cultural heritage value of areas can be expressed in terms of their design or physical, historical or associative or contextual values." Further, "values that contribute to the character of heritage conservation districts may be expressed more broadly as natural, historic, aesthetic, architectural, scenic, scientific, cultural, social or spiritual values. It is

important to note that the “value of the district as a whole is always greater than the sum of its parts” (p10). The *Tool Kit* also emphasises the importance of community input in the identification, designation, and management of HCDs, stating that “[a]s the users and the ultimate guardians, the community forms a vital part of a district” (p5).

The London Plan (2016) and the Ontario Heritage Act

The identification and further study of areas in the City of London for potential heritage conservation district status is supported by the following strategic directions of *The London Plan* (2016). Particularly:

- Direction #1-4: Revitalize our urban neighbourhoods and business areas (Policy 55);
- Direction #3-7: Protect our built and cultural heritage to promote our unique identity and develop links to arts and eco-tourism in the London region (Policy 57);
- Direction #5-2: Sustain, enhance, and revitalize our downtown, main streets, and urban neighbourhoods (Policy 59);
- Direction #7-5: Protect what we cherish by recognizing and enhancing our cultural identity, cultural heritage resources, neighbourhood character, and environmental features (Policy 61).

The *Ontario Heritage Act* does not specifically set out policies to identify potential Heritage Conservation Districts, however the *Act* enables local municipalities to designate Heritage Conservation Districts (HCD) provided the requirements of the *Ontario Heritage Act* are met and the municipality has sufficient supporting policies within its Official Plan.

The London Plan contains sufficient policies to enable the designation of an HCD in accordance with the *Ontario Heritage Act*, as well as the identification of criteria for the evaluation of potential HCDs (Policy 575).

“City Council will consider the following criteria in the evaluation of an area for designation as a heritage conservation district:

1. The association of the area with a particular historical event or era that is unique to the community.
2. The presence of properties which are considered significant to the community as a result of their location or setting.
3. The presence of properties representing a design or method of construction which is considered to be of cultural heritage value or interest to the community, region, province, or nation.
4. The presence of properties which collectively represent a certain aspect of the development of the city that is worthy of maintaining.
5. The presence of physical, environmental, or aesthetic elements which, individually, may not constitute sufficient grounds for designation as a heritage conservation district, but which collectively are significant to the community” (Policy 576).

Secondary Plans and other tools (such as Cultural Heritage Guideline documents) are described in the Our Tools part of the Plan under Guideline Documents. The following policies enable and describe the addition of Guideline Documents to *The London Plan*:

- “City Council may adopt guideline documents to provide direction for the implementation of the policies of this Plan or to guide development of a specific area. Guideline documents may contain guidelines, standards, and performance criteria that are either too detailed, or require more flexibility in interpretation or implementation than the policies of this Plan would allow. (Policy 1712)
- Guideline documents will be adopted by resolution of City Council. Planning and development applications and public works shall be reviewed to determine their consistency with the provisions of any applicable guideline document, and conditions may be imposed upon the approval of development accordingly. Provincial guideline documents will also be used to implement the policies of this Plan. (Policy 1713)

- The preparation of a guideline document will include provisions to encourage input from agencies, associations, and individuals that have an interest in the subject matter. Before adopting or amending a guideline document, City Council will hold a public meeting to provide for input from interested parties” (Policies 1712 - 1714).

Strategic Plan 2015-2019

Heritage conservation is identified as an integral part of “Building a Sustainable City” in the *Strategic Plan for the City of London 2015-2019*. The preparation and implementation of Heritage Conservation District Plans is identified as one of the strategies for achieving our goal to “*protect and celebrate London’s heritage for current and future generations*” (6B).

5.0 Next Steps

This report recommends that *Heritage Places 2.0: A Description of Potential Heritage Conservation Districts in the City of London* be identified as a Cultural Heritage Guideline document in Policy 1721_ of *The London Plan*. Further, this report presents a draft Official Plan Amendment for circulation to amend Policy 1721_4 of the Cultural Heritage Guidelines under Guideline Documents of the Our Tools Section of *The London Plan*, to remove reference to “Heritage Places: A Description of Potential Heritage Conservation Areas in the City of London”, and to replace it with reference to “Heritage Places 2.0: A Description of Potential Heritage Conservation Districts in the City of London.”

The next steps prior to approval of the proposed Official Plan amendment (O-8965) is to: incorporate comments received from this Public Participation Meeting in the preparation of the final *Heritage Places 2.0* guideline document; circulate the attached draft of *Heritage Places 2.0* for feedback from the London Advisory Committee on Heritage (LACH), the Urban League and relevant neighbourhood associations; and, present the final *Heritage Places 2.0* guideline document and proposed Official Plan amendment (O-8965) at a future meeting of the Planning and Environment Committee in Q2 – 2019.

Prepared by:	Laura E. Dent, M.Arch, PhD, MCIP, RPP Heritage Planner.
Prepared by:	W.J. Charles Parker, MA Senior Planner – Long Range Planning and Research
Submitted by:	Gregg Barrett, AICP Manager, Long Range Planning and Research
Recommended by:	John M. Fleming, MCIP, RPP Managing Director, Planning and City Planner
Note: The opinions contained herein are offered by a person or persons qualified to provide expert opinion. Further detail with respect to qualifications can be obtained from Planning Services	

November 5, 2018
LED/cp

Appendix A

Bill No. (number to be inserted by Clerk's Office)
2018

By-law No. C.P.-XXXX-____

A by-law to amend The London Plan for the City of London, 2016 to replace the existing *Heritage Places* guideline document with an updated *Heritage Places 2.0* guideline document.

The Municipal Council of The Corporation of the City of London enacts as follows:

1. Amendment No. (to be inserted by Clerk's Office) to The London Plan for the City of London Planning Area – 2016, as contained in the text attached hereto and forming part of this by-law, is adopted.
2. This by-law shall come into effect in accordance with subsection 17(38) of the *Planning Act, R.S.O. 1990, c.P.13*.

PASSED in Open Council on

Matt Brown
Mayor

Catharine Saunders
City Clerk

First Reading –
Second Reading –
Third Reading –

**AMENDMENT NO.
to the
THE LONDON FOR THE CITY OF LONDON**

A. PURPOSE OF THIS AMENDMENT

The purpose of this Amendment is to delete an existing policy in Section 1721_4 (Culture Heritage Guidelines) of *The London Plan* for the City of London and replace with a new entry.

B. LOCATION OF THIS AMENDMENT

This Amendment applies to all lands located in the City of London.

C. BASIS OF THE AMENDMENT

1. The recommended amendment is consistent with Section 2.6.1 of the *Provincial Policy Statement (PPS)*, 2014 directing that “significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved.”
2. *The London Plan* provides for the adoption of Guideline Documents to provide direction for the implementation of the policies of the *Plan*. Guideline documents provide guidelines, standards and performance criteria for the evaluation of planning applications and may assist in the implementation of the policies of the *Plan*.
3. At its meeting on January 17, 2017, Municipal Council resolved that Civic Administration review the prioritized list of potential heritage conservation districts in the City, as well as update the current Heritage Places guideline document. The adoption of this guideline document fulfils this Council direction.

D. THE AMENDMENT

The London Plan is hereby amended as follows:

1. Policy 1721_4 with regard to Cultural Heritage Guidelines Documents is deleted in its entirety and replaced with the following policy;
 4. *Heritage Places 2.0: A Description of Potential Heritage Conservation Districts in the City of London.*

Appendix B

Previous Reports Pertinent to this Matter

2017, January 17. Municipal Council Resolution, re: recommend update of *Heritage Places*, 7.n.

2014, November 4. Report to the Planning and Environment Committee. Heritage Conservation District Work Plan and Prioritization.

2014, September 2. Municipal Council Resolution, re: prioritization of Heritage Conservation Districts in the City, 14.a.

2014, August 26. Report to the Planning and Environment Committee. Heritage Conservation District Status Report.

2003, August 25. Report to the Planning Committee. Potential Heritage Conservation District Priority List.

1993. *Heritage Places: A Description of Potential Heritage Conservation Areas in the City of London*.

1993, June 21. Municipal Council Resolution, re: approval of Heritage Places as guideline document to the *Official Plan*, 10.

Appendix C

Heritage Places 2.0: A Description of Potential Heritage Conservation Districts in the City of London