

## Report to the London Advisory Committee on Heritage

**To:** Chair and Members  
London Advisory Committee on Heritage

**From:** John M. Fleming  
Managing Director, Planning and City Planner

**Subject:** Heritage Alteration Permit Application By: M. Telford  
200 Wharncliffe Road North, Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage  
Conservation District

**Meeting on:** Wednesday March 14, 2018

## Recommendation

That, on the recommendation of the Managing Director, Planning and City Planner, with the advice of the Heritage Planner, the application under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* to alter the porch of the building located at 200 Wharncliffe Road North, within the Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District, **BE PERMITTED** with the following terms and conditions:

- (a) The Heritage Planner be circulated on the applicant's Building Permit application drawings to verify compliance with the submitted design prior to issuance of the Building Permit;
- (b) All exposed wood be painted;
- (c) Square spindles set between a top and bottom rail be installed as the guard;
- (d) The top rail of the guard be aligned with the height of the capstone of the cast concrete plinths; and,
- (e) The Heritage Alteration Permit be displayed in a location visible from the street until the work is completed.

## Executive Summary

### Summary of Request

The property at 200 Wharncliffe Road North was altered without obtaining Heritage Alteration Permit approval. This Heritage Alteration Permit application seeks to remove the unapproved porch baluster and replace it with a painted wood baluster which is in keeping with the heritage character of the Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District.

### Purpose and the Effect of Recommended Action

The purpose and effect of the recommended action is to ensure that the replacement porch baluster is compatible with the heritage character of the Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District through the application of terms and conditions.

### Rationale of Recommended Action

Unapproved alterations to the porch are not compatible with the *Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District Plan*. The proposed replacement baluster for the porch is compatible.

## Analysis

### 1.0 Background

#### 1.1 Property Location

The property at 200 Wharncliffe Road North is located on the west side of Wharncliffe Road North between Empress Avenue and Paul Street (Appendix A).

#### 1.2 Cultural Heritage Status

The property at 200 Wharncliffe Road North is located within the Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District, which was designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* on May 15, 2015. The property at 200 Wharncliffe Road North is a Contributing Resource to the Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District.

#### 1.3 Description

The cultural heritage resource located at 200 Wharncliffe Road North is a one-and-a-half storey frame dwelling (Appendix B). The building was constructed in 1910, which is consistent with adjacent and nearby properties with one-and-a-half storey frame dwellings on the west side of Wharncliffe Road North. “New houses” are noted between 186 Wharncliffe Road North and 212 Wharncliffe Road North on the 1909-1910 City Directory.

The porch located at 200 Wharncliffe Road North is composed of square piers set on rusticated cast concrete block plinths at each end of the porch, connected by a shallow-pointed wood arch beam. Two shorter shallow-pointed beams connect the porch to the structure of the building. A rusticated cast concrete block plinth is located adjacent to the wood entrance steps to the porch. The steps are located directly in front of the entry door to the building. The porch has a tongue and groove wood floor, which had a painted finish. The railings are affixed at the capstone of the concrete block plinth. The railings were once comprised of turned spindles set widely between a top and bottom rail; these were replaced with chamfered-end square pickets affixed outside of a top and bottom rail (see Appendix B). A painted wood lattice porch skirt set in a wood frame finishes the porch.

### 2.0 Legislative/Policy Framework

The *Provincial Policy Statement* (2014) states that “significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved.” The *Official Plan* (1989, as amended)/*The London Plan* (approved 2016) provides policies that cultural heritage resources will be conserved and protected.

#### 2.1 Ontario Heritage Act

A Heritage Alteration Permit is required to make alterations to a property within a Heritage Conservation District. Per Section 41.1(5.e) of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the *Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District Plan* has defined verandah (porch) alterations as requiring Heritage Alteration Permit approval. As the alterations were undertaken prior to obtaining Heritage Alteration Permit approval, this application met the Conditions for Referral defined within the Delegated Authority By-law (By-law No. C.P.-1502-129), thus requiring consultation with the London Advisory Committee on Heritage (LACH) and a decision by Municipal Council.

The *Ontario Heritage Act* enables municipalities to give the applicant:

- a) The permit applied for;
- b) Notice that the council is refusing the application for the permit; or,
- c) The permit applied for, with terms and conditions attached (Section 42(4), Ontario Heritage Act).

Municipal Council must respond within 90 days after receipt of a demolition request and/or Heritage Alteration Permit application (Section 42(4), *Ontario Heritage Act*).

## **2.2 Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District Plan**

Porches are an important heritage attribute of the Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District. The conservation of porches supports the heritage character of the Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District.

Design Guidelines for Alterations are outlined in Section 10.3.1 of the *Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District Plan*. It states, “Care must be taken in heritage conservation districts to ensure that both alterations and additions respect the surrounding context, particularly with respect to scale and form, and are complementary to the original building.” It notes that “alterations to the façades of buildings visible from the front, and side of the building on corner lots, have the potential to significantly affect the appearance of not only the building itself, but the entire streetscape.”

Section 11.2.9 of the *Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District Plan* provides guidelines on the conservation of porches. It discourages the removal or substantial alteration of existing porches in their size, shape, and design, as well as removing or covering original porches or porch details. It states,

*When restoring a porch that is either intact or completely demolished, some research should be undertaken to determine the original design which may have been much different from its current condition and decide whether to restore the original.*

Guidelines recommend the use of wood, while discouraging fiberglass and plastic versions or imitations, and paint to protect the finished product.

## **3.0 Heritage Alteration Permit Application**

As required by the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the *Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District Plan* identifies classes of alterations that require, or do not require, Heritage Alteration Permit approval. Porch (verandah) alterations with different materials, size, and design requires Heritage Alteration Permit approval. Unapproved alterations to the porch at 200 Wharncliffe Road North were made before March 16, 2017. Complaints from the community brought this unapproved alteration to the attention of the City, and enforcement action ensued.

A Heritage Alteration Permit application was submitted by the property owner and received on February 9, 2018. The property owner has applied for a Heritage Alteration Permit to:

- Removed the unapproved wood baluster; and,
- Replace it with a new baluster with the following details:
  - Wood material;
  - Painted finish; and,
  - Square spindles set between a top and bottom rail at the existing height.

Per Section 42(4) of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the 90-day timeline for the Heritage Alteration Permit application will expire on May 10, 2018.

## **4.0 Analysis**

The porch railing that was installed before March 16, 2017 is not compatible with the heritage character of the Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District. It was altered without Heritage Alteration Permit approval. While retention and restoration of heritage attributes is preferred, this approach is not possible for the porch of the building at 200 Wharncliffe Road North. The former baluster of the porch was comprised of turned spindles set widely between a top and bottom rail. This was replaced by the present baluster which is comprised of chamfered-end square spindles affixed outside

of a top and bottom rail which does not fit in with the heritage character of the Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District (see Appendix B). It is not clear when the turned spindles were installed; however, they do not appear to be historic in origin due to their wide spacing and unpainted finish. There is no historic documentation (e.g. historic photographs) to accurately identify historic precedence or the “authentic limits” of a restoration approach, so a design approach seeking compatibility with the heritage character of the Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District was sought. Examples of porch balustrades that fit within the heritage character of the Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District can be found locally, at 197 Wharncliffe Road North and 149 Wharncliffe Road North (see Appendix B, Images 8-9). These examples should guide the replacement of the existing porch balustrade at 200 Wharncliffe Road North. The unapproved alterations to the porch at 200 Wharncliffe Road North did not change the proportions or dimensions of the porch. The unapproved alterations retained the historic height of the railing at approximately 24”, which aligns with the capstone of the cast concrete plinths (see Appendix B).

Compatibility can be achieved through replacement of the existing balustrade with a traditional balustrade for a porch comprised of square spindles set between a top and bottom rail. This style should also be used on the railings for the steps. The top rail of the balustrade must align with the capstone of the cast concrete plinths, as existing and former. The spindles should be spaced no more than 4” on centre.

## **5.0 Conclusion**

The porch at 200 Wharncliffe Road North, a Contributing Resource in the Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District, was altered without a Building Permit or a Heritage Alteration Permit. The details of the porch that was constructed is not compliant with the *Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District Plan*. To achieve greater compatibility, the railings should be replaced. This replacement, as well as the painting of all exposed wood, will help to bring the porch at 200 Wharncliffe Road North into greater compliance with the *Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District Plan*.

<b>Prepared by:</b>	<b>Kyle Gonyou, CAHP</b> <b>Heritage Planner</b>
<b>Submitted by:</b>	<b>Jim Yanchula, MCIP, RPP</b> <b>Manager, Urban Regeneration</b>
<b>Recommended by:</b>	<b>John M. Fleming, MCIP, RPP</b> <b>Managing Director, Planning and City Planner</b>

March 7, 2018  
KG/

\\FILE2\users-z\pdp\Shared\policy\HERITAGE\Heritage Alteration Permit Reports\Wharncliffe Road North, 200\HAP18-007-L\2018-03-14 LACH HAP18-007-L.docx

**Appendix A – Map**



Figure 1: Property location of 200 Wharnclyffe Road North.

**Appendix B – Images**



*Image 1: View of the property located at 200 Wharncliffe Road North (April 2015).*



*Image 2: View of the property located at 200 Wharncliffe Road North (July 2016).*



*Image 3: View of the property located at 200 Wharncliffe Road North (March 16, 2017).*



*Image 4: View of the property located at 200 Wharncliffe Road North (February 26, 2018).*



*Image 5: Detail of the existing front (east) balustrade of the porch of the building at 200 Wharncliffe Road North.*



*Image 6: Detail of existing south balustrade of the porch of the building at 200 Wharncliffe Road North.*





*Image 7: Detail of existing north and east balustrades of the porch of the building at 200 Wharnccliffe Road North.*



*Image 8: Detail of porch balustrade at appropriate height with appropriate details and finish located at the building at 197 Wharnccliffe Road North. Note the height of the balustrade is at the appropriate height to match the capstone of the brick plinths.*



*Image 9: Detail of porch balustrade at appropriate height with appropriate details and finish located at the building at 149 Wharncliffe Road North. Note the height of the balustrade is at the appropriate height to match the capstone of the cast concrete plinths.*