

--	--

HAP 17-039-L
K. Gonyou

TO:	CHAIR AND MEMBERS LONDON ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON HERITAGE MEETING ON WEDNESDAY JULY 12, 2017
FROM:	JOHN M. FLEMING MANAGING DIRECTOR, PLANNING AND CITY PLANNER
SUBJECT:	HERITAGE ALTERATION PERMIT APPLICATION AT 169 BRUCE STREET, WORTLEY VILLAGE-OLD SOUTH HCD BY: EMERALD TRADING CORP.

RECOMMENDATION

That, on the recommendation of the Managing Director, Planning & City Planner, with the advice of the Heritage Planner, the application under Section 42 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* to alter windows and chimney and to erect a new porch at the building located at 169 Bruce Street, within the Wortley Village-Old South Heritage Conservation District, **BE PERMITTED** as submitted in the proposed alteration drawings attached hereto as Appendix C with the following terms and conditions:

- a. All exposed wood be painted;
- b. Brick be considered as the material for the replacement chimney; and,
- c. The Heritage Alteration Permit be displayed in a location visible from the street until the work is completed.

PURPOSE AND EFFECT OF RECOMMENDED ACTION

The purpose of the recommended action is to permit the alteration of a property located within the Wortley Village-Old South Heritage Conservation District (HCD), in accordance with Section 42(2.1) of the *Ontario Heritage Act* and the classes of alterations identified in the *Wortley Village-Old South HCD Plan*.

PREVIOUS REPORTS PERTINENT TO THIS MATTER
--

None.

BACKGROUND

Location

The property at 169 Bruce Street is located on the south side of Bruce Street between Wortley Road and Marley Place (Appendix A).

Property

--	--

**HAP 17-039-L
K. Gonyou**

The property at 169 Bruce Street designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* on June 1, 2015 as part of the *Wortley Village-Old South HCD*. 169 Bruce Street is a B-ranked properties by the *Wortley Village-Old South HCD Plan*.

Description

The building at 169 Bruce Street has the form of a side hall plan cottage (Appendix B). A painted wood verandah, accessed by four steps up from ground level, spans the front (north) façade of the building. The verandah retains many of its historic details including the brackets and spandrels, with a traditional wooden railing. The building has a hipped roof clad in asphalt shingles with a non-original chimney constructed of concrete block that is located on the west façade. The windows on the front façade appear to be original with wooden, sash style two-over-two pattern with moulded hood trim and wood storm windows. Windows on other façades have been replaced and have different trim. The building has been rendered with parging. The building has been adapted to accommodate multiple units, with a secondary access in an addition on the east side of the building (169 A Bruce Street).

HERITAGE ALTERATION PERMIT APPLICATION

As required by the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the *Wortley Village-Old South HCD Plan* identifies classes of alterations that require, or do not require, Heritage Alteration Permit approval. Window alterations and chimney alterations require Heritage Alteration Permit approval. Alterations to the windows were made on or about November 10, 2016 without a Building Permit or a Heritage Alteration Permit. Complaints from the community brought this unapproved alteration to the attention of the City, and enforcement action ensued.

A Heritage Alteration Permit application was submitted by the applicant and received on June 9, 2017. The applicant has applied for a Heritage Alteration Permit to:

- Remove the existing concrete block chimney and reconstruct a new chimney in its place with concrete block;
- Retroactive approval for the construction of a new wooden porch at the side door, built on a wooden platform with wooden railings and posts; and,
- Retroactive approval for installation of a new 2'x3' window on the southeast corner of 169 A Bruce Street to allow more light into the studio unit. The stucco was cut to accommodate the window with a 3" x 3" lintel.

ANALYSIS

One of the objectives of the designation of *Wortley Village-Old South* as a HCD is to “avoid the destruction and/or inappropriate alteration of the existing building stock, materials, and details” (Section 3). This is achieved partly by establishing policies and guidelines within the *Wortley Village-Old South HCD Plan* regarding alterations to ensure they are sensitive to the heritage attributes and details of the *Wortley Village-Old South HCD*, and are based on appropriate research and examination of archival and/or contextual information.

Window Alteration

--	--

HAP 17-039-L
K. Gonyou

Section 8.2.7 of the *Wortley Village-Old South HCD Plan* notes the following details on windows. “Doors and windows are necessary elements for any building, but their layout and decorative treatment provides a host of opportunities for the builder to flaunt their unique qualities and character of each building” (Section 8.2.7).

Section 8.3.1.1 of the *Wortley Village-Old South HCD Plan* provides evaluation criteria for considering alterations to heritage designated properties. While these policies support the conservation (retention and restoration) of existing heritage attributes, guidelines are also provided for the evaluation of replacement features. Section 8.3.1.1.f provides specific guidelines for windows:

Section 8.3.1.1	
Recommended Practices and Design Guidelines	Analysis
f. Where replacement of features (e.g. doors, windows, trim) is unavoidable, the replacement components should be of the same style, size, proportion, and material wherever possible;	Style: The replacement windows are double hung sash windows, which is the same as the historic wood windows on the front (north) façade and other existing windows on the building.
	Size: One window was added and one window was reduced in size.
	Proportion: The reduction of the window impacts the relationship between the two windows on the east façade, as well as the new window further to the rear. As the building is rendered with parging, the cladding has been well finished to disguise any evidence of the alterations. Trim detail has been replicated to maintain some continuity with other window openings of the building.
	Material: The previous windows do not appear to be wood windows; the replacement window are vinyl, which is consistent with other replacement windows on the building. The windows on the main (north) façade are the original wood windows.

The reduction of the size of one window and the addition of one new window constitutes an adverse impact to this cultural heritage resource. These impacts have been mitigated by the use of consistent style of window with the other windows of the building, as well as the replication of the trim details. Because the building is parged, evidence of past alterations have been mitigated.

Porch

Porches are a heritage attribute of the Wortley Village-Old South HCD. Guidelines of the *Wortley Village-Old South HCD Plan* encourage the conservation of existing porches (Section 9.5). Guidelines encourage the use of wood as the primary material.

A small porch area at the entrance to 169 A Bruce Street was added (see Appendix B.

--	--

HAP 17-039-L
K. Gonyou

Image 5). Because of the height of the porch, no Building Permit was required. However, a Heritage Alteration Permit is still required.

Provided that the new porch is painted, it is compliant with the guidelines of the *Wortley Village-Old South HCD Plan* because it demonstrates compatibility with the existing verandah of the building at 169 Bruce Street. The railing of the new porch is consistent with that of the existing; a traditional wooden top and bottom rail, with square spindles set between, and square newel posts.

Chimney

The existing chimney at 169 Bruce Street is not believed to be original to the construction of the building, but it contributes to the rhythm and pattern of chimneys that support the heritage character of the Wortley Village-Old South HCD. The existing chimney is in need of reconstruction. Section 9.3.3 of the *Wortley Village-Old South HCD Plan* recommends that the existing chimney be documented to allow for replication of design details. The existing concrete block could be used in the reconstruction of the chimney, but brick should be considered as it is a more historically appropriate material.

CONCLUSION

The completed and proposed alterations to the property at 169 Bruce Street are compliant with the guidelines of the *Wortley Village-Old South HCD* and should be permitted with terms and conditions.

PREPARED BY:	SUBMITTED BY:
KYLE GONYOU, CAHP HERITAGE PLANNER URBAN REGENERATION	JIM YANCHULA, MCIP, RPP MANAGER URBAN REGENERATION
RECOMMENDED BY:	
JOHN M. FLEMING, MCIP, RPP MANAGING DIRECTOR, PLANNING AND CITY PLANNER	

2017-06-22

Attach:

Agenda Item # Page #

--	--

Item

Page #

HAP 17-039-L
K. Gonyou

Appendix A – Map
Appendix B – Images

Y:\Shared\policy\HERITAGE\Heritage Alteration Permit Reports\Bruce Street, 169\HAP17-039-L\2017-07-12 LACH HAP17-039-L.docx

Agenda Item # Page #

--	--

Item #
Page #

HAP 17-039-L
K. Gonyou

APPENDIX A — Map



Map 1: Property location of 169 Bruce Street in the Wortley Village-Old South HCD.

--	--

HAP 17-039-L
K. Gonyou

APPENDIX B — Images



Image 1: Building at 169 Bruce Street (2016-06-14).



Image 2: Building at 169 Bruce Street (2016-06-14).



Image 3: Alterations windows at 169 Bruce Street (2016-11-10).



Image 4: Detail of altered window on the east façade (2016-11-10).



Image 5: Recent image of the east façade of the building at 169 Bruce Street (2017-06-13).



Image 6: Recent image of the building at 169 Bruce Street (2017-06-13).

Agenda Item # Page #

--	--

Item

Page #

HAP 17-039-L
K. Gonyou



Image 7: West façade of the building at 169 Bruce Street showing the chimney (2017-06-13).



Image 8: Detail of the chimney (2016-11-15).