

|  |  |
|--|--|
|  |  |
|--|--|

|                 |  |
|-----------------|--|
| <b>TO:</b>      | <b>CHAIR AND MEMBERS<br/>LONDON ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON HERITAGE<br/>MEETING ON WEDNESDAY APRIL 13, 2016</b> |
| <b>FROM:</b>    | <b>JOHN M. FLEMING<br/>MANAGING DIRECTOR, PLANNING AND CITY PLANNER</b>                                    |
| <b>SUBJECT:</b> | <b>REQUEST FOR DEMOLITION BY MAJESTY COMMERCIAL PROPERTIES<br/>INC., 80 OXFORD STREET WEST</b>             |

|                       |
|-----------------------|
| <b>RECOMMENDATION</b> |
|-----------------------|

That, on the recommendation of the Managing Director, Planning & City Planner, with the advice of the Heritage Planner, with respect to the request for the demolition of a heritage listed property located at 80 Oxford Street West the following report **BE RECEIVED** and that the following action **BE TAKEN**:

- A. That the Chief Building Official be advised that Municipal Council consents to the demolition of the building located at 80 Oxford Street West;
- B. That 78, 80, 82, 84, 86, and 88 Oxford Street West be removed from the Register (*Inventory of Heritage Resources*);
- C. That prior to the removal of the above properties from the Register and the demolition of 80 Oxford Street West, high quality photographic documentation and as-built measured drawings of all exterior elevations of the buildings located on those properties be prepared and submitted to the satisfaction of the Heritage Planner to ensure an archival record of these properties exists to allow for future research and commemoration; and,
- D. That commemoration of the cultural heritage value or interest of 78-88 Oxford Street West be undertaken in a near-by public space as part of the implementation and construction of civic infrastructure projects.

|  |
|--|
| <b>PREVIOUS REPORTS PERTINENT TO THIS MATTER</b> |
|--|

2008, May 5: Report to PEC: "Application By: Jamie Deakin, 78-80 Oxford Street West."

2014, April 29: Report to PEC: "City of London Official Plan Review, Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District Plan and Conservation Guidelines and Official Plan Amendments to Implement District."

2015, July 16: Report to LACH: "Western Road/Oxford Street Environmental Assessment 78-88 Oxford Street West."

2015, October 6. Report to Civic Works Committee: "Western Road/Wharncliffe Road North Widening Environmental Study Report."

|   |
|---|
| <b>PURPOSE AND EFFECT OF RECOMMENDED ACTION</b> |
|---|

The purpose of the recommended action is to address the cultural heritage value or interest of the properties located at 78-88 Oxford Street West in a comprehensive manner, recognizing their principal value as a set of six properties together. The effect of the recommended action is to remove these properties from the Register (*Inventory of Heritage Resources*), thus enabling the future removal of the buildings located thereon, following compliance with the recommended

|  |  |
|--|--|
|  |  |
|--|--|

mitigation approach.

|                   |
|-------------------|
| <b>BACKGROUND</b> |
|-------------------|

**Location and History**

78-88 Oxford Street West are properties located on the south side of Oxford Street West, west of Wharncliffe Road North (Appendix A). The residential dwellings on each of the properties appear to have been built in rapid succession between 1906 and 1907, likely by the same unknown builder. The buildings are consistent in their form, scale, and massing with a consistent setback along the south side of Oxford Street West (Appendix B1). The buildings are one-and-three-quarters stories in height, topped by a gambrel roof which is popular in the Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District (Appendix B2). With the exception of the buildings at 84 and 88 Oxford Street West, each of the buildings has a recessed entry door with a column or post supporting the structure above. The entry at 84 Oxford Street West was enclosed circa 2009-2011, and the façade cladding was added in summer 2015. 88 Oxford Street West has a flat roof verandah, supported by square piers set on brick plinths. Originally, a segmented arch window adorned the ground storey façade with a triplet window located above in the imbricated gambrel end. Dormers to the east and west adopted a similar gambrel style of the main roof. Each of the buildings has been altered since its construction to varying degrees; however, all retain the characteristic gambrel roof.

Shortly after their construction, the properties were featured in the *London Free Press* article “A Booming Section of a Booming City” (March 28, 1914), which extolled the virtues of London West.

**Heritage Status**

80 Oxford Street West (Priority 2) and 88 Oxford Street West (Priority 2) were included on the *Inventory of Heritage Resources* (the Register pursuant to Section 27 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*) prior to 2006. In 2008, Municipal Council added 78 Oxford Street West (Priority 3), 82 Oxford Street West (Priority 2), 84 Oxford Street West (Priority 3), and 86 Oxford Street West (Priority 3) to the *Inventory of Heritage Resources*. All six of the properties at 78-88 Oxford Street West are heritage listed properties.

**Planning History**

In 2008, a Zoning By-law Amendment application for the properties located at 78-80 Oxford Street West was refused. The demolition of “a Priority 2 heritage building reducing the significance of the remaining group of similar buildings” was part of the rationale for its refusal. This decision was appealed to the Ontario Municipal Board, but the appeal was subsequently withdrawn prior to the hearing.

The LACH was asked to consider the addition of 78, 82, 84, and 86 Oxford Street West to the *Inventory of Heritage Resources*, which it ultimately recommended. Municipal Council subsequently added those properties to the *Inventory of Heritage Resources* on September 29, 2008.

At its meeting held on November 3, 2008, Municipal Council requested the LACH prepare “reasons for heritage designation” for 78-88 Oxford Street West. The LACH did so at its meeting held on June 10, 2009, and the “statements of significance” were referred to Civic Administration. No further action was taken at that time.

The Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District Study was initiated in spring 2013. The initial study area included the subject properties; however the Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District boundary designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* did not

|  |  |
|--|--|
|  |  |
|--|--|

include 78-88 Oxford Street West. The *Blackfriars/Petersville West Guideline Document* was adopted by Municipal Council at the time of the designation of Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District in 2014, which includes 78-88 Oxford Street West.

The *Blackfriars/Petersville West Guideline Document* identified the “distinguishable character” of the sub-areas not included within the Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District. 78-88 Oxford Street West were noted for their inclusion in the *London Free Press* article, “A Booming Section of a Booming City” (1914). The gambrel roofs of the six buildings were highlighted by the *Blackfriars/Petersville West Guideline Document* which recommended listing of all six properties on the *Inventory of Heritage Resources* (the Register).

As part of the Municipal Class Environmental Assessment (EA) for the Western Road/Wharncliffe Road North Widening, a review of recognized and potential cultural heritage resources was undertaken. In response to a staff report to the LACH on its meeting held on July 16, 2015, the LACH recommended that,

- a) *“The report of the Managing Director, Planning and City Planner dated July 16, 2015 entitled “Western Road/Oxford Street Environmental Assessment 78-88 Oxford Street West” BE RECEIVED;*
- b) *The Stewardship Sub-Committee BE REQUESTED to evaluate the heritage value of the properties known as 78 to 88 Oxford Street West and report back to the next meeting of the London Advisory Committee on Heritage (LACH) of their findings;*
- c) *The consultant BE REQUESTED to evaluate the impact of placing the existing buildings at an increased setback from the front lot line in order to preserve the buildings;*

*It being noted that the London Advisory Committee on Heritage (LACH) expressed an interest in preserving the buildings known as 78 to 88 Oxford Street West as the grouping of these buildings along a major arterial road provides for a unique heritage opportunity for London;*

*It being further noted that the LACH received a report from the Stewardship Sub-Committee regarding this matter.*

At its meeting held on July 29, 2015, the Stewardship Sub-Committee recommended the retention of the buildings on all six properties, noting that the westerly four (82-88 Oxford Street West) should be designated under Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. At its meeting held on August 19, 2015, the LACH deferred consideration of the properties located at 78-88 Oxford Street West to a future meeting.

A Cultural Heritage Evaluation Report (CHER) (AECOM, August 2015) of the properties located at 78-88 Oxford Street West was undertaken to evaluate the cultural heritage value or interest of the six properties. This CHER confirmed the cultural heritage value or interest of 78-88 Oxford Street West as articulated by the LACH in 2009, particularly their value as a group of six houses together. Draft Statements of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest were prepared as part of the CHER.

At its meeting held on September 9, 2015, the LACH received a presentation from AECOM regarding the CHER for the properties at 78-88 Oxford Street West. The LACH recommended,

*“That the matter of the proposed designation of the properties located at 78-88 Oxford Street West BE DEFERRED to such time as the Stewardship Sub-Committee receives the Consultant report on the Heritage Impact Assessment for the above-noted properties; it being noted that the London Advisory Committee on Heritage received the attached presentation from C. Andreae, Heritage Planner, AECOM, with respect to this matter.”*

|  |  |
|--|--|
|  |  |
|--|--|

Through its recommendation, the LACH recognized the on-going EA process to understand the preferred alternatives of the Western Road/Wharncliffe Road North Widening EA to identify potential conservation options for 78-88 Oxford Street West prior to making a recommendation.

The Western Road/Wharncliffe Road North Widening EA has since concluded. The CHER was included as part of the Background Reports section of the Environmental Study Report (October 2015), noting that a Heritage Impact Assessment would be required. The intent of a Heritage Impact Assessment is to identify potential impacts to a cultural heritage resource as the result of a proposed development or site alteration and to recommend mitigation approaches to conserve the cultural heritage value or interest of those resources. The Heritage Impact Assessment for 78-88 Oxford Street West (AECOM, March 2016) was received on March 31, 2016 and is included as Appendix C of this report.

A demolition request for 80 Oxford Street West was received on March 7, 2016. In accordance with Section 27(3) of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, Municipal Council has 60 days thereafter to make a decision on the demolition request, including consultation with the LACH, either to designate the property under Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* or to consent to the demolition. Given the previously articulated contextual value shared between all of the properties at 78-88 Oxford Street West, a comprehensive approach to reconcile their cultural heritage value or interest is preferred.

|                 |
|-----------------|
| <b>ANALYSIS</b> |
|-----------------|

Section 2.6.1 of the *Provincial Policy Statement* (2014) directs that “significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved.” “Significant” is defined in the *Provincial Policy Statement* (2014) as, in regards to cultural heritage and archaeology, “resources that have been determined to have cultural heritage value or interest for the important contribution they make to our understanding of the history of a place, and event, or a people.” The objectives of Chapter 13 (Heritage) of the City of London’s Official Plan comply with these policies. The Strategic Plan for the City of London 2015-2019 identifies heritage conservation an integral part of “Building a Sustainable City.”

Per the *Provincial Policy Statement*, “conserved” means:

“the identification, protection, management and use of built heritage resources, cultural heritage landscapes and archaeological resources in a manner that ensures their cultural heritage value or interest is retained under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. This may be achieved by the implementation of recommendations set out in a conservation plan, archaeological assessment, and/or heritage impact assessment. Mitigative measures and/or alternative development can be included in these plans and assessments” (*Provincial Policy Statement* 2014).

**Comparative Analysis**

The form of the buildings located at 78-88 Oxford Street West contributes to their physical or design value. Colonial revivals, such as the Dutch Colonial Revival exemplified in the gambrel roof style, were particularly popular architectural influences from around the turn of the twentieth century until circa World War I.

A preliminary survey of gambrel roof buildings within the Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District was undertaken, which identified many buildings with this particular roof style (see Appendix B2). There are many individual buildings with gambrel roofs (120 Wharncliffe Road North, Image 16), some duos of gambrel roof buildings (37-39 Wilson Avenue, Image 10), trios (226-230 Wharncliffe Road North, Image 20), a quintet (20-30 Wilson Avenue, Image 9), and one other known sextet (136-146 Wharncliffe Road North, Image 17).

|  |  |
|--|--|
|  |  |
|--|--|

While a row of six historic buildings of the same form and design are rare, a local example at 136-146 Wharncliffe Road North is comparable to 78-88 Oxford Street West. 136-146 Wharncliffe Road North is protected under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* as part of the Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District.

**Collective Value**

78-88 Oxford Street West is a set of six properties that together have been identified for their cultural heritage value or interest. This value primarily lies in the six buildings collectively located on those properties. To remove one of those six buildings on those properties, particularly one in the middle of the row, would severely diminish the contextual value of those remaining properties.

Given the comparative analysis of rows of gambrel roof buildings within the Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District, the removal of one of the six buildings on those properties would diminish the contextual value of those remaining properties to a point that the remaining properties may not warrant designation under Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Therefore, an approach which recognizes the cultural heritage value or interest of the six properties at 78-88 Oxford Street West together is preferred.

**Heritage Impact Assessment**

While the in situ conservation of the built heritage resources at 78-88 Oxford Street West is preferred, there may be other mitigative measures that are appropriate to conserve their cultural heritage value or interest. The Heritage Impact Assessment for 78-88 Oxford Street West (see Appendix C) explored mitigation options, noting that the proposed widening of Oxford Street West may result in the loss/destruction and/or alteration of the buildings located at 78-88 Oxford Street West. Mitigation options considered included:

- Relocation of the houses on the existing lots;
- Detailed documentation;
- Retaining a portion of the facades as a commemorative element;
- Interpretive signs, plaques, and/or public art installations; and,
- Footprint location of buildings.

Relocation was explored by the Heritage Impact Assessment, concluding that the cost of relocation (estimated at \$100,000-\$150,000 per house) and associated technical challenges (e.g. UTRCA, size of lots, impacts on adjacent properties) would be prohibitive. Relocation can also diminish the contextual value of the original setting of the resource and is generally not preferred.

The Heritage Impact Assessment recommended that detailed documentation be undertaken for each of the buildings located at 78-88 Oxford Street West prior to demolition and that interpretive signs, plaques, and/or a public art installation could be used to commemorate the six properties.

The Stewardship Sub-Committee of the LACH received the Heritage Impact Assessment for 78-88 Oxford Street West at its meeting held on March 31, 2016. The Stewardship Sub-Committee recommended that “78, 80, 82, 84, 86, and 88 Oxford Street west be removed from the Register, provided that all six properties are documented with photographs and as built drawings and commemorated, per the Heritage Impact Assessment.”

**Detailed Documentation**

To ensure an archival record of these properties exists to allow for future research and commemoration, detailed documentation should be undertaken. Detailed documentation should include:

- Historical narrative of relevant background information;

Agenda Item # Page #

|  |  |
|--|--|
|  |  |
|--|--|

Item #  
Page #

- Measured, scalable drawings of each building’s exterior elevation noting existing materials, major alterations and additions; and,
- High resolution photography of each building’s exterior elevations under optimal environmental conditions (e.g. not raining; cloudy day ideal);

It is essential that detailed documentation be undertaken prior to the issuance of a demolition permit for any of the properties at 78-88 Oxford Street West. Transportation Planning & Design has agreed to cover the costs associated with the photographic and as built drawing documentation of the buildings located at 78-88 Oxford Street West.

**Commemoration**

In situations where in situ retention is not appropriate, commemoration may be an acceptable form of conservation. Heritage interpretive signage, such as that at Victoria Park, is successful in conveying stories associated with Victoria Park that are not readily apparent such as the archaeological record of the military garrison or London’s Free Integrated School. Plaques are a more traditional form of commemoration and record historic events or former buildings using words. A public art installation may be the most effective means of communicating the contextual value of 78-88 Oxford Street West and could be broadly interpreted in a creative, but meaningful, manner.

Commemoration of any lost cultural heritage resource should be undertaken in a publicly-accessible space, such as along the West London Dyke, a local park or parkette, or in an urban civic space. Opportunities for the commemoration of 78-88 Oxford Street West should be undertaken as part of the implementation and construction of civic infrastructure projects in the vicinity. Transportation Planning & Design has agreed to cover the costs associated with the commemoration of 78-88 Oxford Street West to an upset limit.

**Other Matters**

Previous property standards orders on the building located at 80 Oxford Street has prompted concerns regarding its condition. The issue was referred to the Building Division.

Condition is not a criterion for designation under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

|                   |
|-------------------|
| <b>CONCLUSION</b> |
|-------------------|

The value of the properties located at 78-88 Oxford Street West is best understood as a set together. Addressing their cultural heritage value or interest in a comprehensive manner is preferred.

While Municipal Council may issue its notice of intent to designate the six properties at 78-88 Oxford Street West under Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* with the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest within the Heritage Impact Assessment (see Appendix C), the documentation and commemoration of these six properties will sufficiently conserve their cultural heritage value or interest.

|                     |                                |
|---------------------|--------------------------------|
| <b>PREPARED BY:</b> | <b>SUBMITTED BY:</b>           |
|                     |                                |
| <b>KYLE GONYOU</b>  | <b>JIM YANCHULA, MCIP, RPP</b> |

Agenda Item # Page #

|  |  |
|--|--|
|  |  |
|--|--|

Item

Page #

|  |                                       |
|--|---------------------------------------|
| <b>HERITAGE PLANNER<br/>URBAN REGENERATION</b>                                     | <b>MANAGER<br/>URBAN REGENERATION</b> |
| <b>RECOMMENDED BY:</b>   |                                       |
|  |                                       |
| <b>JOHN M. FLEMING, MCIP, RPP<br/>MANAGING DIRECTOR, PLANNING AND CITY PLANNER</b> |                                       |

Attach:

- Appendix A: Property Location – 78-88 Oxford Street West
- Appendix B1: Property Photographs – 78-88 Oxford Street West
- Appendix B2: Property Photographs – Gambrel Roofs within Blackfriars/Petersville Heritage Conservation District
- Appendix C: *Heritage Impact Assessment 78, 80, 82, 84, 86, 88 Oxford Street West, London, Ontario* (AECOM, March 2016).

Y:\Shared\policy\HERITAGE\Demolition\Oxford Street West, 80\LACH 2016-04-13\LACH Demo Request 80 Oxford Street West.docx

|  |  |
|--|--|
|  |  |
|--|--|

### APPENDIX A: Property Location – 78-88 Oxford Street West





|  |  |
|--|--|
|  |  |
|--|--|

**Appendix B1: Property Photographs – 78-88 Oxford Street West**



Image 1: 78-88 Oxford Street West.



Image 2: 78 Oxford Street West.



Image 3: 80 Oxford Street West.

|  |  |
|--|--|
|  |  |
|--|--|

Item

#  
Page #



Image 4: 82 Oxford Street West.



Image 5: 84 Oxford Street West.



Image 6: 86 Oxford Street West.



Image 7: 88 Oxford Street West.

|  |  |
|--|--|
|  |  |
|--|--|

Item

#  
Page #

**Appendix B2: Property Photographs – Gambrel Roofs within Blackfriars/ Petersville Heritage Conservation District**



Image 8: 12-16 Oxford Street West (3 properties).



Image 9: 20-30 Mount Pleasant Avenue (5 properties).



Image 10: 37-39 Wilson Avenue (2 properties).



Image 11: 72 Rogers Avenue.



Image 13: 77 Rogers Avenue.



Image 14: 78 Rogers Avenue.

|  |  |
|--|--|
|  |  |
|--|--|

Item

#  
Page #



Image 15: 108 Wharncliffe Road North.



Image 16: 120 Wharncliffe Road North.



Image 17: 136-146 Wharncliffe Road North (6 properties).



Image 18: 160-164 Wharncliffe Road North.



Image 19: 197-201 Wharncliffe Road North (3 properties).



Image 20: 226-230 Wharncliffe Road North (3 properties).

Agenda Item # Page #

|  |  |
|--|--|
|  |  |
|--|--|

Item

Page #

**Appendix C: Heritage Impact Assessment 78, 80, 82, 84, 86, 88 Oxford Street West (AECOM, March 2016)**