

--	--

D. Menard:

<b>TO:</b>	<b>CHAIR AND MEMBERS PLANNING &amp; ENVIRONMENT COMMITTEE</b>
<b>FROM:</b>	<b>JOHN M. FLEMING MANAGING DIRECTOR, PLANNING AND CITY PLANNER</b>
<b>SUBJECT:</b>	<b>REQUEST FOR DEMOLITION B. NORMAN 1057 RICHMOND STREET PUBLIC PARTICIPATION MEETING TUESDAY, JULY 22, 2014: NOT BEFORE 5:00 P.M.</b>

<b>RECOMMENDATION</b>
-----------------------

That, on the recommendation of the Managing Director, Planning and City Planner, with the advice of the Heritage Planner, the request by the owners for the demolition of the building at 1057 Richmond Street, **BE DENIED**; it being noted that the London Advisory Committee on Heritage has been consulted on this request.

<b>PREVIOUS REPORTS PERTINENT TO THIS MATTER</b>
--------------------------------------------------

October 8, 2013: Planning and Environment Committee: **Application by Romlex International Inc. 1057, 1059, and 1061 Richmond street**

<b>BACKGROUND</b>
-------------------

**The Property**

The property at 1057 Richmond Street is located on the west side of Richmond between Sherwood Avenue and Victoria Street. (Appendix 1) The property contains a residential structure with two residential units. It is listed on the *Inventory of Heritage Resources* as a Priority 2 building, indicating that it has the potential for designation under Section 29 (Part IV) of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

**Request for Demolition of a Listed Property**

A request for the demolition of the property was submitted on behalf of Marilyn and Brinn Norman, by Romlex International, acting as agent for the owners, in early June. Because it is listed on the *Heritage Inventory*, a request for its demolition must be considered by Municipal Council within 60 days, following consultation with the Advisory Committee on Heritage and a public participation meeting before the Planning and Environment Committee. Council may choose to support the request for demolition, support it with conditions, or not support the request for demolition. Council may also choose to issue a notice of its intent to designate the property under Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* if it wishes to conserve the building. A refusal of the request for demolition, or approval with conditions is subject to appeal to the Ontario Municipal Board. An owner may also appeal a notice of Council's Intent to Designate to the Conservation Review Board.

Agenda Item #	Page #

D. Menard:

**Previous Development Applications Relevant to this matter**

In 2013, arising from earlier applications, an application for rezoning was received by the City from Romlex International to develop a site which included the properties at 1061, 1059 and 1057 Richmond Street. The nature of the application was to change the zoning on this site to allow for an increase in the residential density on the site by placing dwelling units within the existing church building. The application was subsequently appealed to the Ontario Municipal Board (PL 130668) The appeal was both allowed in part and dismissed in some respects on the basis of a settlement reached between the City and Romlex International, the owner of 1061 Richmond, that would allow for an increase in residential density up to a total of 9 dwelling units within the church building, in return for the designation, under the *Ontario Heritage Act* of 1061 Richmond (former Robinson Memorial Church). In his summary of the background and evidence presented the Board Officer stated:

*(6) The proposal resulting from the settlement would permit 9 instead of 14 dwelling units within the existing church structure, would maintain the existing open space associated with the former manse property, would result in the dwelling unit at 1057 Richmond Street being removed and replaced with 11 off street parking spaces. The proposed parking area would be subject to a landscape buffer that would prohibit access to the municipal lane as set out on the site plan (Exhibit 2, Tab, p. 168), resulting in the parking area only having direct and full turning movement's access to Richmond Street. The settlement also call for the erection of a brick wall along a portion of the Richmond Street frontage consistent with the architecture of the church building, all of which is subject to site plan control. The site plan control by-law and agreement are not before the Board."*

Notwithstanding the above, Legal Services has advised that the "City's ordinary procedure for demolition requests must be followed." It notes that the OMB had before it on appeal only the Zoning by-law Amendment. Neither the existing site control by-law nor agreement was before the Board on this hearing. The reference to the demolition of 1057 Richmond Street was not before the Board for consideration on that appeal. It was referenced in paragraph 6 of the decision merely as background with reference to the proposed development of the lands. In summary, Legal Services concludes that "the OMB decision rezones the lands in accordance with the Zoning By-Law Amendment attached to the decision, and its effect is limited to that rezoning. All other development-related issues must proceed through our ordinary procedures, including any site plan approval, heritage designation of the church building and demolition requests."

In December, 2013, the former Robinson Memorial United Church was designated under Section 29 of the *Ontario Heritage Act* as a building of cultural heritage value and interest.

**LACH Comments**

In its comments on an earlier application related to the site redevelopment, the LACH, at its meeting in June 2013, had noted that the property at 1057 Richmond was not part of the proposal for the potential designation of the former church but did not take a position with respect to a possible demolition/designation of the building at 1057 Richmond. In 1993, with respect to a previous application, the LACAC recommended against the demolition of both 1057 and 1059 Richmond, the former church manse, suggesting that 1057 should be preserved for architectural and historical reasons and 1059 should be preserved for contextual reasons. 1059 was later demolished with the proviso that the property at 1059 Richmond should be landscaped as green space, adjacent to the church. This proviso was confirmed at the November, 2013, OMB settlement.

With respect to this application for demolition, the LACH considered the worthiness of 1057 Richmond Street for designation at its meeting on July 9, 2014. Its recommendation will come forward at the meeting of the Planning Committee on July 22, 2014.

Agenda Item #	Page #

**D. Menard:**

## **Designation**

Does the building at 1057 Richmond Street merit designation under Section 29 of the Ontario Heritage Act? Regulation 9/06 establishes the criteria to be considered in assessing the worthiness of a structure for designation under this Section of the Act. There are three broad areas, any one of which may be sufficient to recommend designation. These areas are: design values, historic associations and contextual relationships.

Design features of note include decorated brackets, the half finial, a rectangular stained glass window in the gable, two bay windows, and the original doors with incised rondelles, all appropriate to a Late Victorian home here expressed in a vernacular style. Some interior features remain, but the interior has been remodelled for rental purposes. While the property retains several original architectural elements, with respect to Regulation 9/06, it is not a rare, unique, representative or early example of a style, type, expression, material or construction method. Nor does it display a high degree of craftsmanship or artistic merit.

City Directory information notes occupations of two long-staying owner/residents - John Francis, a letter carrier who lived there from 1898 through 1933 and C. Erb, who lived there with her husband, a government inspector, from approximately 1943 through 1973. Historic associations are not significant to support an argument for designation.

The structure does have contextual value in that it helps in defining, maintaining or supporting the character of an area. In a neighbourhood character study completed in July 2011, with respect to the streetscape near the intersection of Richmond Street and Victoria Avenue note was made of the following features in this block:

- single detached houses are the predominant type within the area even if many have been altered to contain two or more units.*
- dwellings have a consistent setback and garages are located near the rear of the lots.*
- massing ranges from one to two-and-a-half stories. Dwellings are cubic shapes with pitched roofs and often have a porch that is cubic form.*
- front doors are typically accessed by a pathway through the front yard connecting to the City sidewalk.*
- low shrubs in front yard close to the front of the dwellings; along Richmond Street is a consistent row of mature deciduous trees between the sidewalk and the front of the building.*
- asphalt shingled roofs, predominately brick clad, with no front yard fencing or walls.*

In summary, a case can be made for designation on the basis of this property's remaining architectural features and contextual features.

## Analysis /Recommendations

While there may be a basis for designating the property at 1057 Richmond Street under Section 29, consideration may also be given to the long term consequences of doing so with respect to the context of the former church building. Robinson Memorial church was designated in 2013 for its exterior features, historic associations and contextual importance. At the time of its designation, it was assumed that the interior would be altered to accommodate residential units. Such alterations have not yet happened. There remains a possibility that the former church may find a new congregation which would allow the church function to continue. A new congregation will require parking, perhaps in excess of what is currently available.

Although the loss of 1057 Richmond was anticipated on the basis of a proposed development involving 1059 and 1061 Richmond Street: *The proposal resulting from the settlement... would result in the dwelling unit at 1057 Richmond Street being removed and replaced with 11 off street parking spaces*, since this specific redevelopment does not appear to be going forward, it may premature to demolish the heritage property at 1057 Richmond until there is greater certainty as to what may replace it. It may, potentially, be desired to remove it to accommodate parking requirements. If so, it may also be premature to designate the property.

--	--

D. Menard:

**Recommendation**

It is recommended that Municipal Council deny the request for demolition at this time. It is further recommended that Municipal Council not proceed with designation at this time.

<b>PREPARED BY:</b>	<b>SUBMITTED BY:</b>
<b>DON MENARD HERITAGE PLANNER URBAN REGENERATION</b>	<b>JIM YANCHULA, MCIP, RPP MANAGER URBAN REGENERATION</b>
<b>RECOMMENDED BY:</b>	
<b>JOHN M. FLEMING, MCIP, RPP MANAGING DIRECTOR, PLANNING AND CITY PLANNER</b>	

June 23, 2014

dm/

Attach: Appendix 1- Location Map; Appendix 2- Photos

Y:\Shared\policy\HERITAGE\Demolition\1057 Richmond Street North\PEC July 22 2014.docx

**Appendix 1- Location Map - 1057 Richmond Street North**





--	--

D. Menard:

Appendix 2: Photos -1057 Richmond Street





Agenda Item # Page #

--	--

D. Menard:

Appendix 2 -Photos - 1057 Richmond

